ISSLP
Interdisciplinary Studies in Society, Law and Politics

OPEN PEER REVIEW

Effective Strategies for Preventing and Controlling Security Incidents and Crises in Sistan and Baluchestan Province

Hamed. Javadi[1]*, Ali Akbar. Amini[2], Hamid. Saeedi Javadi[1]

[1] Department of Political Science , Ma.C., Islamic Azad University, Mashhad, Iran
[2] Department of Political Science, CT.C., Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

* **Corresponding author email address**: hamed.policyresearcher@gmail.com

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sentence, "Accordingly, this study seeks to answer the following key question…" introduces a single question, yet the following sentence begins with "both of these questions." Please revise for consistency or clearly specify both questions if intended.

The definition from Zangeneh Moghaddam et al. (2023) is helpful but could be enhanced by distinguishing "security crises" from general political instability. Clarify what makes a crisis in this context "security-centric" rather than merely "political."

The section gives an excellent theoretical overview but lacks engagement with local interpretations or contestations of the term "terrorism" in Sistan and Baluchestan. You may consider discussing how labeling certain groups as "terrorist" affects local-state relations.

This section provides detailed historical accounts, but many are presented without analytical framing. Consider grouping events thematically (e.g., symbolic violence, cross-border operations, sectarian targets) and reflecting briefly on the implications.

The claim, "Even in today's globalized world, the speed of threat transmission is still directly related to physical distance…" is crucial to the regional focus but is not empirically substantiated in the article. Recommend adding a data point or example relevant to Sistan and Baluchestan.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2.   Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The article references Koulayi (2007), Rezaee et al. (2012), and Pishgahi Fard & Mirzadeh Kouhshahi (2014) without providing sufficient critical analysis. It would strengthen the manuscript to discuss how these studies fall short or where gaps remain, thereby justifying the present research.

The section quotes Buzan & Wæver (2003) and Boldrin et al. (2015) but could benefit from more integration of these theories with the specific context of Iran's southeastern borderlands. Consider adding a sentence linking the Copenhagen School's conceptualization of security with local socio-political conditions.

The quote referencing Ban Ki-moon's condemnation lacks a source. Consider citing the original statement or providing a reference to the UN press release for academic rigor.

The sentence, "A crucial point is that their development is rooted in Western identity…" is too generalized. Recommend revising or supporting this assertion with a citation or a more nuanced discussion of how Eurocentric biases influence security theory.

The discussion of Hegel, Marx, and Nietzsche is insightful but somewhat tangential. Consider streamlining or connecting more directly to security studies or the case study at hand.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2.   Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.
Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.