

Climate Reparations and Legal Accountability: Bridging International Law and Environmental Justice

Sophie Chenier¹ , Daniel Tremblay^{2*} 

¹ Department of International Relations, McGill University, Montreal, Canada

² Department of Political Science, University of Toronto, Toronto, Canada

* Corresponding author email address: daniel.tremblay@utoronto.ca


Received: 2025-01-24

Revised: 2025-02-25

Accepted: 2025-03-16


Published: 2025-04-01

EDITOR:

Tahereh Ebrahimifar 


Head of Sociology Department, Faculty of Arts, Helwan University, Cairo, Egypt. Email: Tah.Ebrahimifar@iauctb.ac.ir

REVIEWER 1:

Mustafa Kaan Tuysuz 

Institute of Social Sciences, Siirt University, Siirt, Turkey. Email: AhmetKılıç@siirt.edu.tr

REVIEWER 2:

Muhammad Abdul Rahman 

Department of Humanities, Rajaratnam School of International Studies, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore. Email: muhammadrahman@ntu.edu.sg

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

When stating that "The southwestern coastal region of Bangladesh... has faced severe disruptions," it would be beneficial to include quantitative data or a direct citation to support the claim, as this enhances empirical grounding.

The sentence "Recent proposals suggest the creation of compensation funds..." would be stronger if an example of such a fund (proposed or piloted) was briefly described or cited.

The reference to AOSIS in 1991 is critical; however, citing a primary UNFCCC document from that period would substantiate the historical accuracy of the claim.

The statement "climate reparations are also understood as a continuation of anti-colonial struggles" would benefit from further elaboration or an illustrative case (e.g., a regional initiative or advocacy statement) to strengthen this powerful argument.

The phrase "civil society has played a crucial role" is too general. Consider naming specific international or local NGOs that have advanced reparations claims through legal or diplomatic channels.

You mention "diffuse and cumulative nature of greenhouse gases complicates the direct assignment of legal liability." This key problem deserves an additional sentence on the role of probabilistic causation in emerging tort litigation.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The sentence "...an advisory opinion from the International Court of Justice (ICJ) on states' legal obligations..." should clarify what specific legal questions were posed to the ICJ and their potential implications for legal precedent.

The phrase “This narrative review seeks to examine...” would benefit from a clearer statement of research questions or hypotheses guiding the review to better align with academic standards for narrative reviews.

The integration of political philosophy and legal theory is compelling, but consider including a brief conceptual definition of “transitional justice” earlier, as it is later used without full context.

When referencing Bangladesh’s coastal communities, it may be helpful to provide a short discussion on the inadequacies of current aid programs that fail to satisfy distributive justice.

The commentary on the “decision text” of the Paris Agreement precluding liability is important. Please consider discussing how this legal limitation has been interpreted in subsequent climate litigation cases.

The sentence “Human rights-based approaches also enable affected communities to center their own experiences...” would benefit from a concrete case study or example to show how these approaches have worked in practice.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor’s decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief’s decision: Accepted.