OPEN PEER REVIEW



The Principle of Family Consolidation in the Iranian Legal System: A Balance Between Legal and Executive Policymaking

Fatemeh. Jafarzadeh khoorjestan 10, Fariba. Hajiali 2*0

- Master's student in Islamic Law, Faculty of Theology, Al-Zahra University, Tehran, Iran
- ² Associate Professor in Department of Islamic Law, Faculty of Theology, Alzahra University, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: f.hajiali@alzahra.ac.ir

Received: 2025-06-28 Revised: 2025-10-10 Accepted: 2025-10-17 Initial Publish: 2025-10-19 Final Publish: 2026-04-01

EDITOR:

Tahereh Ebrahimifar

Head of Sociology Department, Faculty of Arts, Helwan University, Cairo, Egypt. Email: Tah. Ebrahimifar@iauctb.ac.ir

REVIEWER 1:

Vanessa Indama

Public Administration Department, Basilan State College, Isabela City, Basilan, Philippines. Email: vanesindama@gmail.com

REVIEWER 2:

Mohammadbagher. Jafari

Department of Sociology of Culture, Istanbul, Türkiye. Email: mbjafari@kmanresce.ca

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The phrase "In legal and social systems, the family has always been regarded as the most fundamental unit..." is too general. Consider integrating comparative or statistical evidence (e.g., family stability indicators) to justify the sociological importance of the family in Iranian legal thought.

The discussion of "modern natural law, liberalism, and individualism" in Western family law is valuable but underdeveloped. Please provide at least one specific Western legal source or comparative example (e.g., French or Anglo-American family codes) to strengthen this contextualization.

The article attributes theological reasoning to Moṭaharī (2003) but does not elaborate on how rational inquiry connects to usul al-fiqh methodology. Clarify whether the argument is inductive (based on jurisprudential texts) or deductive (based on normative reasoning).

provisions but lacks citation of Article 21 and its subsections verbatim. Quoting exact constitutional wording would add rigor and transparency to the legal interpretation.

The list is clear, but the transition from normative statements to policy implications could be more explicit. Please discuss how these pillars translate into enforceable state duties under administrative or civil law.

This paragraph is highly evaluative and reads like a policy recommendation. Include empirical or bibliographic evidence (e.g., national reports or UNDP data) to substantiate claims about reduced social harms and improved social capital.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The sentence "Addressing this question requires a precise analysis of legal mechanisms..." suggests an analytical framework, but none is explicitly stated. Please define your research method—e.g., doctrinal analysis, policy review, or content analysis of legislative texts.

The paragraph effectively explains constitutional

The argument on implementation challenges would benefit from statistical or evaluative data. For example, reference national divorce or fertility statistics to demonstrate the "gap between enacted laws and their execution."

The quotation of articles from these documents is accurate but overly descriptive. Condense the narrative and introduce analytical commentary—e.g., how these resolutions institutionalize religious jurisprudence into public policy.

The historical description is valuable; however, include discussion of amendments or subsequent interpretations that show continuity or reform (e.g., post-1979 modifications or judicial opinions affecting Articles 1105–1106).

The analysis could be enriched by referencing empirical judicial data—such as the annual number of divorce petitions or mediation success rates—to ground theoretical assertions in evidence.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

